

Topic: National Discussion and Debate Series: Immigration

Guide Overview:

This packet provides a variety of lessons and activities to help students gain the knowledge and background necessary to engage in a meaningful debate about the following resolution: *“Our national interests require a path to citizenship for the 12 million illegal immigrants already here.”*

These lessons explore myths and facts about the newest wave of immigration to the United States, examine the root causes of immigration, build empathy through personal accounts of immigration, place the immigration debate in a global context, and analyze current immigration reform efforts.

For additional lesson plans about immigration, visit the informative Web sites below. Teachers may opt to complete all the assignments in preparation for the debate, or select those most necessary or interesting to the class. Classes may prepare their debates for submission to the Miller Center National Discussion and Debate Series.

Time: 5-9 class periods, depending on activities chosen and time allotted for each activity

Introduction:

Ideas for introducing the topic of immigration:

- Before beginning the immigration lessons, ask students to write down five immigration headlines over the course of a week and bring them to class. Call on student volunteers to read their headlines. What immigration issues are in the news? What are people most concerned about? Ask students to share what they know about immigration and immigration reform – what are the current immigration challenges facing the American people? What is the current political climate regarding immigration? What issues do students think are important?
- Read the introduction to the Miller Center white paper: [Immigration, Citizenship and the National Interest](#) as a class. Outline the current immigration challenges and reform efforts. What benefits do immigrants bring to American society? What stresses does immigration put on American society? What are the pros and cons of a guest worker program? What are the pros and cons of an enforcement only immigration policy? The United States currently has 12 million non-U.S. citizens – how can the government and citizens address this issue in a way that respects human rights and makes fiscal sense?

Lesson One – Rethinking Borders

The current immigration debate has been punctuated with images of the border. In this lesson, students will examine the concept of borders, analyze and interpret images of the border, and explore the effects of current immigration policy on people at the border. Students will also outline and discuss current immigration issues.

Activities:

- Pre-Reading: Examining a photo of the border
- Article Analysis: “Building a Barrier Along the Border with Mexico”

- Map Activity: Defining Borders
- View and Discuss: “Mexico: A Death in the Desert”
- Overview of the Immigration Debate: Myths vs. Facts

Lesson Two – Faces of Immigration

Because migration rates continue to increase, it is vital that governments seek to understand who is migrating and why so that they can develop effective and humane immigration policies. In the first activity, students will interpret graphs to determine how many people are immigrating to the United States and the main countries of origin for immigrants. Students will then use these statistics to guide a brief discussion of immigration policy. Immigration is about more than numbers and statistics, however. Immigration intimately affects people’s lives in a variety of ways. Students will listen to accounts of people’s immigration experiences in order to build empathy and gain a more personal view of immigration.

Activities:

- Discuss root causes of immigration
- Interpret and analyze immigration graphs
- Brainstorm ways the United States can prepare for an increased immigrant population
- Listen to personal accounts of immigration

Lesson Three – In Search of a Brighter Future

The year following the implementation of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), illegal immigration from Mexico began to increase dramatically as small farmers lost their land to large agribusiness and workers began to feel the effects of lower wages. At the same time that the border opened to corporations and capital, it closed to people and accountability. Operation Gatekeeper was enacted in 1995, and billions of dollars have been spent to increase border fencing and security. Rather than deterring migration, Operation Gatekeeper has only succeeded in forcing migration into the hostile terrain of the desert, resulting in thousands of migrant deaths. This lesson explores the economic inequality that is pushing migrants into the United States and lays the groundwork for informed discussion of policy reform, including guest worker programs and a path to citizenship for the 12 million illegal immigrants already in the United States.

Activities:

- U.S. – Mexico International Shopping Trip
- Rethinking the NAFTA Record
- NAFTA Role Play
- Class Discussion

Lesson Four – The Long Road to Citizenship

In this lesson, students will evaluate their own knowledge about the rights and responsibilities of United States citizens and will research the process for becoming a citizen. Students will also evaluate and discuss President George W. Bush’s proposed path to citizenship for illegal immigrants.

Activities:

- Take a sample citizenship test
- Research the process for becoming a U.S. citizen
- Create guides to explain the citizenship process to immigrants
- Analyze and evaluate path to citizenship proposals

Lesson Five – Towards a Humane and Effective Immigration Policy

In this lesson, students will research and debate current immigration reform proposals. Students will then vote which policy option, or combination of policies, they think would most effectively address current immigration issues.

Activities:

- Research immigration reform proposals
- Debate which policies will most effectively address current immigration issues

Lesson Six – Immigration Student Debate

Students will debate the Miller Center resolution: *“Our national interests require a path to citizenship for the 12 million illegal immigrants already here.”*

Activities:

- Metaphorical Drawing
- Lesson Review
- Student Debate Guide
- Debate

Supplements

- **Vocabulary Builder Activities**
- **Link to National Standards**
- **Suggested Research Links**

Extensions

- Invite members of the community who are interested in or involved with immigration reform to speak to the class about immigration reform. Ideas include administrators of day labor centers, churches who provide assistance to immigrants, school administrators, immigration lawyers, foreign exchange students, human rights activists, labor union representatives, and immigrants.
- For more information and lesson ideas about the history of immigration, use the [PBS Destination America Teacher’s Guide](#).
- For more information and lessons about the current immigration experience, use the [PBS New Americans Educator’s Guide](#).
- For more information and lessons about the experience of Refugees, use the [National Geographic lessons](#) accompanying the film God Grew Tired of Us.
- Many of these lessons were adapted from the resource [The Line Between Us: Teaching About the Border and Mexican Immigration](#) produced by Rethinking Schools.
- Brainstorm student proposals for promoting cross-cultural activities in your community that would increase communication between immigrant groups and

with native born residents. Research ways students can help to implement some of the proposals. Share what your students are doing with PBS Online NewsHour and the Miller Center for Public Affairs.

Vocabulary Builder Activities

Vocabulary Terms

Asylum	Operation Gatekeeper
Bracero Program	Migrant
Coyote	Minute Men
DREAM Act	Migration Flow
Emigration	Migration Stock
E-Verify	Naturalization
Foreign Born	Nonimmigrant
Green Card	North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA)
Guest Worker	Legal Permanent Resident (LPR)
Illegal Immigrant	Proposition 187
Immigration	Remittance
Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE)	Tariffs
Refugee	
SOLVE Act	
Visa	

Vocabulary Activities

- 1. News Report** – Write an editorial answering the following question: Should illegal immigrants be given a path to citizenship? Use at least five vocabulary terms in the editorial.
- 2. Teachable Moment** – A foreign exchange student is coming to study at your school. She starts a conversation about immigration in her home country and asks you to compare it with immigration issues in America. Write a brief explanation of current immigration issues in America using at least five vocabulary terms. Divide into pairs and take turns discussing immigration issues in need of reform.
- 3. Commercial Break** – Develop a commercial advertising your ideas for immigration reform. Use at least three vocabulary terms in your commercial. Present your commercial to the class.
- 4. Vocabulary Match** – Write the definition of each vocabulary term on strips of paper. Write each vocabulary term on separate strips of paper. Distribute the vocabulary terms to some students and the definitions to others. Allow students to walk around the room to find their match. Each pair must then use the term correctly in a sentence.
- 5. Human Resources** – You work for the human resources department at a large firm. Your job is to explain the company's policy for hiring foreign born workers. Explain your company's policy using at least three vocabulary terms

Lesson One: Rethinking Borders

Lesson Overview:

The current immigration debate has been punctuated with images of the border. Groups such as the Minute Men seek increased enforcement along the line that separates the United States and Mexico, the largest source of new immigrants to the United States, and have applauded enforcement efforts such as Operation Gatekeeper, founded the year after the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) was enacted. Human rights activists decry the human toll of increased border enforcement, including thousands of deaths resulting from migrant attempts to cross hostile desert terrain. Environmental activists charge that the border fence is an environmental disaster. Analysts claim that increased border enforcement has been largely ineffective despite the billions of dollars spent, and all agree that immediate immigration policy reform is needed. In this lesson, students will examine the concept of borders, analyze and interpret images of the border, and explore the effects of current immigration policy on people at the border. Students will also outline and discuss current immigration issues.

Objectives:

Students will:

1. Explore the concepts of borders within the context of the immigration debate.
2. Analyze photographs of the border.
3. Critically review text and film to strengthen understanding of current immigration issues.
4. Outline and discuss current immigration issues.

Materials:

- ❖ Photos of the U.S.- Mexico Border (Available from Washington Post's [Life Along La Linea](#) (<http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/world/interactives/mexicoborder/>)
- ❖ Copies of the NPR Article "[Q&A: Building a Barrier Along the Border with Mexico](#)" for each student (<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=5326083>)
- ❖ Highlighters
- ❖ Map of the United States that includes Canada and Mexico
- ❖ *Mexico: A Death in the Desert* Discussion Guide (<http://www.pbs.org/frontlineworld/stories/mexico/thestory.html>)
- ❖ Internet Access
- ❖ Copies of the PBS [Myths vs. Facts](#) Handout (http://www.pbs.org/inthemix/shows/show_teen_immigrants3.html)

Procedure:

Activity One: Reading the Border (50 minutes)

1. Post a photo of the U.S.-Mexico border for the class. (Washington Post's [Life Along La Linea](#) is an excellent resource for border photos). Do not tell students anything about the picture at this point. (*Note: If you have more time, juxtapose*

this image with images of other border fences or crossings, such as the Berlin Wall, the Great Wall of China, or signs at state borders).

2. Ask the class to call out everything they see in the photo (ocean, fence, people, etc.) Then, ask them to list questions they have about the photo. (*Example: Where was the photo taken? What is in the photo? When was it taken? Why was it taken? Who took the photo? What is the purpose of the fence? Who is on either side of the fence? Do you think the fence is an effective barrier?*)
3. Invite students to share their questions as a class.
4. Divide students into small groups and distribute a copy of the NPR Article [“Q&A: Building a Barrier Along the Border with Mexico”](#) along with highlighters. Instruct the group to read the article either out loud or silently as a group and to highlight sections of the article that answer their initial questions about the picture. Tell students to write new questions they have in the margins of the article.
5. When all students are finished reading, call on group members to explain the answers they found to their pre-reading questions. What did they learn about the picture? What did they learn about immigration? The article states that new border fencing will cost at least \$2.2 billion (though some analysts say it will cost as much as \$49 billion). How else could legislators use \$2.2 billion to address rising rates of immigration? What other questions do students have?
6. Inform the class that you will be spending several days learning background information in preparation for a debate about the following topic: *“Our national interests require a path to citizenship for the 12 million illegal immigrants presently here.”* Students will investigate the answers to who is immigrating, why they are immigrating, what the immigration experience is like, and the pros and cons of the current immigration reform proposals.
7. Ask students to write their initial thoughts on the debate topic. Do they agree or disagree with the debate statement? Why? Invite student volunteers to share their responses.
8. Instruct students to write the debate statement at the top of a piece of paper. They will then divide the paper into two columns: Pro and Con. They will write their initial thoughts and opinions in each column. As the class moves through this unit, ask students to put information they learn along the way in one of the two categories in preparation for the final debate.

Activity Two: Defining Borders (50 minutes)

1. Display a map of the United States. Ask students the following questions: What borders do students notice? In which cases are the borders natural (such as rivers) and in which cases are the borders manmade?

2. Ask students the following questions to generate class discussion about borders:
 - What or who are borders designed to keep in? What or who are borders designed to keep out?
 - In what ways do borders protect us? In what ways do borders isolate us?
 - In what ways are borders effective? In what ways are they ineffective?
 - How do you think borders should be enforced? Explain your answer.
3. Look again at the map of the United States. Carefully examine the border with Mexico.
 - How long is the border?
 - Through how many states does the border pass?
 - Through what types of landscapes does the border pass?
 - What challenges might this border pose to those who want to enforce the border? To those who want to cross the border?
 - How does the border impact people's lives?
 - How do you think the border should be managed?
4. The film "Mexico: A Death in the Desert" describes one family's experience crossing the border from Mexico to the United States and outlines many important issues in the immigration debate. Watch the PBS Frontline World film: "[Mexico: A Death In the Desert](#)" (18:42) as a class. Use the discussion questions from before to generate class discussion about the film. (For additional background information about the border, refer to [Essential Backgrounders from the New York Times](#).)
5. Instruct students to take out the Pro/Con chart they started in Activity One. Students will write information they learned in either the pro or con column. Students will refer back to this chart in preparation for the final debate.

Activity Three: Overview of the Immigration Debate - Myths vs. Facts (20-30 min.)

1. Ask students to list immigration issues people are concerned about (*Ex. Immigrants taking jobs from Americans, too many immigrants, strain on American schools and health care, difficult for immigrant children to get into college, long lines for immigrant families to be reunited, human rights violations at the border, immigration raids, minute men*).
2. Immigration policy must strike a difficult balance between the cultural and economic benefits of a diverse immigrant population and the cultural and economic tensions that often accompany the arrival of large numbers of immigrants. Moderate a class discussion about the stresses and benefits of immigration. This is a time for students to freely share thoughts and ideas about immigration. They will learn more facts about immigration over the course of the next three lessons.

- Ask students to brainstorm the pros and cons of immigration. How do immigrants benefit American society? What strains do immigrant populations put on American society?
 - Do students think there should be a limit on the number of immigrants allowed in the United States each year or should the United States have an open door policy towards immigration? If students are in favor of a limit on immigration, how will they determine how many immigrants should be allowed per year? Should there be a cap on how many immigrants originate from each country per year?
 - What benefits should temporary workers receive? What about immigrants pursuing citizenship? What about illegal immigrants?
3. Distribute or post the PBS [Myths vs. Facts](#) handout. Read the handout together as a class. Ask student volunteers to share something they learned from the handout. What immigration issues does the handout not address? What else do students want to know about the current immigration debate?
 4. Instruct students to take out the Pro/Con chart they started in Activity One. Students will write information they learned in either the pro or con column. Students will refer back to this chart in preparation for the final debate.

**Note – If you have more time, use the lesson plans accompanying the PBS series [The Statue of Liberty](#) to help students put the current immigration debate in a historical context. (<http://www.pbs.org/kenburns/statueofliberty/educators/lessons.html>)*

“Mexico: A Death In the Desert” Discussion Guide

1. What is daily life like in Matias’s village of Oaxaca? What differences do you notice between life in his village and life in your community?
2. Prior to his death, Matias had crossed the U.S./Mexico border several times. Why did he cross the border? How long did Matias typically stay in the United States?
3. Why does Matias’s wife say that migrants return home to their village each year?
4. What did the money Matias earned while working in the United States pay for?
5. Why did Matias decide to stop crossing into the United States? How did he plan to make money? What happened?
6. What do you think would have enabled Matias to stay with his family in his home village rather than immigrating to the United States each year?
7. Describe Matias’s journey from Oaxaca into the United States. How did he get from Oaxaca to the Arizona border? What did he take with him on the journey? How long was the journey? What dangers did he face along the way?
8. Matias’s uncle, Bertoldo, describes border crossing in earlier years. How is crossing the border today different from crossing the border in 1990? Do you think that increased border security has deterred immigrants?
9. Why did Operation Gatekeeper attempt to force migrants to cross the border in the desert? What is the result of their efforts?
10. Who does increased border enforcement benefit? Why do you think Operation Gatekeeper was founded the year after NAFTA (the North American Free Trade Agreement) was enacted?
11. Why did Matias cross the desert in the hottest part of the year? What happened to Matias? What happened to his brother, Serafin, and his cousin?
12. Describe the journey from Border Patrol Agent Mike Walsh’s perspective. In what ways does his narrative differ from the narrative of Matias’s wife and mother?
13. How did Matias’s death impact life for his wife and children? How will his wife get money to pay for clothes and school in his absence?
14. Why do you think people cross the border despite the dangers involved? Do you think you would cross the border if you were in Matias’s situation? Why or why not? What would you do?

15. What information in the film surprised or interested you? What other observations or questions do you have? In what ways does the film impact your thoughts on immigration?

Lesson Two: Faces of Immigration

Lesson Overview:

When considering current immigration issues, it is important for students to situate the American immigration debate within the context of global migration patterns. According to the International Organization for Migration (IOM), 192 million people (3% of the world's population) are currently living outside of their land of birth and more people are on the move today than at any other point in history. Because migration rates continue to increase, it is vital that governments seek to understand who is migrating and why so that they can develop effective and humane immigration policies. In the first activity, students will interpret graphs to determine how many people are immigrating to the United States and their main countries of origin. Immigration is about more than numbers and statistics, however. Immigration intimately affects people's lives in a variety of ways. Students will listen to accounts of people's immigration experiences in order to build empathy and gain a more personal view of immigration.

Objectives:

Students will:

- 1) Discuss the root causes of immigration.
- 2) Interpret immigration statistics and graphs.
- 3) Apply information from graphs to immigration policy discussion.
- 4) Understand the immigration experience by listening to personal accounts

Materials:

- ❖ Internet Access

Procedure:

Activity One: Faces of Immigration – Evaluating Graphs (30 minutes)

1. Ask students to list reasons they think people immigrate to other countries. Write reasons on the board.
 - Have students considered refugees?
 - Family members of immigrants?
 - Economic issues?
 - Environmental issues?
 - Political issues?
 - War?
 - What are the difficulties immigrants might face when moving to a new country?
 - Ask students if they would ever migrate to another country. Why or why not?

2. Read the IOM page [About Migration](http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/lang/en/pid/3) as a class backgrounder before continuing with this activity. (<http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/lang/en/pid/3>)
3. Why are people immigrating to the United States? When analyzing the reasons people immigrate to the United States, it is important to consider how many people are immigrating and the conditions in their country of origin that might be pushing them to migrate. Analyze the following graph as a class: [“Size of the Foreign Born Population and Foreign Born as a Percentage of the Total Population: 1850-2006.”](http://www.migrationinformation.org/datahub/charts/final.fb.shtml)
(<http://www.migrationinformation.org/datahub/charts/final.fb.shtml>)
 - In what decade was the percentage of the foreign born the greatest in the United States? Why do you think immigration rates may have been especially high at that time?
 - In what decade was the percentage of the foreign born the lowest in the United States? Why do you think immigration may have been especially low during this time period?
 - In 2006, what was the percentage of the foreign born in the United States?
 - How much did the foreign born population grow between 1970 and 2006? Why do you think so many immigrants entered the United States during this time?
 - Do you think that the United States can sustain this rate of growth? Why or why not? Explain your answer.
4. From what countries are people immigrating? Review the [“Demographic, Educational, and Linguistic Characteristics”](http://www.migrationinformation.org/USfocus/display.cfm?id=649#5) section (<http://www.migrationinformation.org/USfocus/display.cfm?id=649#5>) of the Migration Information page and [“Annual Immigration to the United States: The Real Numbers”](http://www.migrationpolicy.org/pubs/FS16_USImmigration_051807.pdf) to find out.
(http://www.migrationpolicy.org/pubs/FS16_USImmigration_051807.pdf)
5. According to the IOM, considering no immigration, a low rate of fertility (currently 1.85 children per woman), and an aging population, the United States would have about 300 million people in 2050 (slightly below replacement level). Analysts predict, however, that the United States will have 409 million people in 2050 as a result of immigration. In other words, 80% of the population growth in the United States from 2000-2050 will be a result of immigration. Begin a class discussion using the following questions:
 - The immigrant population as a percentage of the total population of the United States is continuing to increase. What changes might an increased immigrant population bring to American society?
 - What benefits might immigrants bring to the United States?
 - In what ways might an increased immigrant population put stresses on American society?
 - What measures could the United States and its citizens take to prepare for an increased immigrant population?

- In what ways could the United States help immigrants and native born citizens live and work peacefully together?

6. Instruct students to refer back to the debate chart they made in the introductory activity. Consider the debate topic again and write information they learned from this lesson in the pro and con columns. Ask if students have any further questions.

Further Study Activity

Immigration policy must strike a difficult balance between the cultural and economic benefits of a diverse immigrant population and the cultural and economic tensions that often accompany the arrival of large numbers of immigrants. Divide students into small groups and assign each group one of the following countries: Mexico, China, the Philippines, India, or Cuba - the top five countries of origin for new immigrants coming to the United States. Instruct students to research the reasons people are emigrating from their assigned country using the [Migration Information Source Country Resources](http://www.migrationinformation.org/Resources/) page (<http://www.migrationinformation.org/Resources/>) and the [International Organization for Migration](http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/lang/en/pid/3) page (<http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/lang/en/pid/3>). What policies might the United States adopt to deal with the root causes of immigration from each of the five countries? How might the United States help immigrants from each of these countries adapt to American culture? Groups will present their findings to the class.

Activity Two: Faces of Immigration – Personal Stories (At least 30 min.)

1. Statistics on immigration tell part of the story, but it is equally important to hear from immigrants themselves. What is the immigration experience like? Listen to Blanca Alvarez tell her daughter Connie about her journey across the border to America as part of the [National StoryCorps Project](http://www.storycorps.net/listen/stories/blanca-and-connie-alvarez). (<http://www.storycorps.net/listen/stories/blanca-and-connie-alvarez>)
2. View clips and ask student volunteers to read excerpts from PBS's [The New American Series](http://www.pbs.org/independentlens/newamericans/newamericans.html). (<http://www.pbs.org/independentlens/newamericans/newamericans.html>)
If you are interested in additional immigration stories, visit [My Immigration Story](http://www.myimmigrationstory.com/) (<http://www.myimmigrationstory.com/>) and [Recent Stories of Immigration](http://library.thinkquest.org/20619/Present.html). (<http://library.thinkquest.org/20619/Present.html>)
Instruct students to consider the following questions as they listen to the immigration stories:
 - a. What patterns do you notice about why people come to the United States or about the immigration experiences people have?
 - b. What details or observations strike you as important and why?
 - c. In what ways do these stories connect with your own experiences?
 - d. In what ways do these stories impact your views about immigration?
 - e. In what ways do you think immigrants enrich life in America?
3. Share which story you found to be especially meaningful and explain why the story resonated with you. Use the above questions to generate class discussion.

4. Instruct students to refer back to the debate chart they made in the introductory activity. Consider the debate topic again and write information they learned from this lesson in the pro and con columns. Ask if students have any further questions.

Further Study

Invite members of your community to share their immigration stories with the class. Also, invite community organizations that work with immigrants to share their thoughts on immigration and immigration policy.

**Note – If you have more time, assign students the [Oral History Project](#) from The New American Series.*

(http://www.pbs.org/independentlens/newamericans/foreducators_lesson_plan_09.html)

Lesson Three: In Search of a Brighter Future

Lesson Overview:

The year following the implementation of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), illegal immigration from Mexico began to increase dramatically as small farmers lost their land to large agribusiness and workers began to feel the effects of lower wages. At the same time that the border opened to corporations and capital, it closed to people and accountability. Operation Gatekeeper was enacted in 1995, and billions of dollars have been spent to increase border fencing and security. Rather than deterring migration, Operation Gatekeeper has only succeeded in forcing migration into the hostile terrain of the desert, resulting in thousands of migrant deaths. This lesson explores the economic inequality that is pushing migrants into the United States and lays the groundwork for informed discussion of policy reform, including guest worker programs and a path to citizenship for the 12 million illegal immigrants already in the United States.

Objectives:

Students Will:

1. Examine the effects of free trade on wages, worker's rights, and immigration
2. Understand how wage disparity affects immigration
3. Analyze the effects of NAFTA on labor unions and the environment
4. Critically discuss revisions to NAFTA that would benefit workers, corporations, the economy, and the environment.

Materials:

- ❖ Internet Access
- ❖ Wage Comparison Questions
- ❖ Copies of NAFTA Role Play (1 for each group)
- ❖ Copies of NAFTA Conference Roles (1 role for each student)

- ❖ Nametags
- ❖ One copy of each article listed in Activity Two
- ❖ Highlighters

Activity One: A Race for Capital (30 minutes)

1. Companies are now forced to compete for a share in the global economy. In order to stay competitive, they must minimize costs and maximize profits. Labor rights and stringent environmental regulations protect people, but they are also costly. Many large American corporations are moving production to other nations in an effort to minimize production costs. In order for students to see how corporate globalization and free trade impacts worker's rights and immigration, allow them ten minutes to go on a [US-Mexico International Shopping Trip](http://www.ueinternational.org/shop/index.php). The website (<http://www.ueinternational.org/shop/index.php>) asks students to choose a job category, such as garment worker. It then shows photos of two garment workers and explains how much each one earns in a week. Students can then “go shopping” at an online store using the worker's wages. The website then shows how many hours each of the employees would have to work in order to afford the goods in the shopping basket.
2. Distribute the Wage Comparison Questions and review directions with students.
3. When all students are finished, discuss student findings as a class. Instruct students to refer back to the debate chart they made in the introductory activity. Consider the debate topic again and write information they learned from this lesson in the pro and con columns. Ask if students have any further questions.

**Note – If you have more time, use the lesson plans accompanying the PBS series [China From the Inside](http://www.pbs.org/kqed/chinainside/edlesson1.html) to learn more about the impacts of globalization on immigration rates and worker's rights in China. (<http://www.pbs.org/kqed/chinainside/edlesson1.html>)*

Activity Two: Reevaluating NAFTA (Two class periods)

Overview: The following activity leads students in an investigation of the connection between NAFTA and rising rates of illegal immigration.

1. Briefly introduce NAFTA to students.

NAFTA (the North American Free Trade Agreement) is an agreement between the United States, Canada and Mexico to reduce tariffs (taxes on imports) as well as trade and investment barriers in an effort to stimulate all three economies. Proponents claimed that NAFTA would create jobs and strengthen the economy while also increasing corporate profits. Instead, both Mexican and American workers have experienced job loss and reduced wages since NAFTA. According to the Economic Policy Institute, NAFTA has led to the loss of close to 1 million U.S. jobs and has increased America's trade deficit. NAFTA has also had significant environmental impacts, as companies have capitalized on the less stringent environmental laws in Mexico. In addition, NAFTA has devastated small

farmers in Mexico, as cheap food imports from the United States and the increase in large agribusiness in Mexico has forced them from their land. Finally, NAFTA has led to a dramatic increase in illegal immigration to the United States. Low wages at the maquiladoras, loss of subsistence farming, and increased poverty have forced people north in search of work. Between 250,000 and 515,000 migrants cross the border illegally each year. In the past, migration between Mexico and the United States was circular, meaning that migrant workers would work during certain seasons, and would then return home. Increased border enforcement, and the danger of crossing the border in hostile desert terrain, has resulted in more permanent migration patterns. One of the main criticisms of NAFTA is that the border is open to corporations and capital, but closed to workers and accountability.

2. Explain to students that they will be participating in a role play about NAFTA. Distribute the NAFTA Role Play and explain the scenario to the students.
3. Distribute one NAFTA Conference Role to each student in the class. There are only 16 roles, so some students will have the same role. Each interpretation and presentation of the role, however, will be unique.
4. Give students nametags and tell them to create a name for their assigned role. *Ex. Maria, Maquiladora Worker*. Tell students to read the role several times and to underline key points. Their task is to take on the persona of their assigned role.
5. Explain the directions for the assignment. Students will have 10-15 minutes to meet each other and answer questions on the NAFTA Role Play worksheet. Students should spend time listening to each other's stories rather than racing to complete the questions. They will be able to draw on each other's stories during the policy discussion. Model a role play conversation for the class with a student volunteer.
6. After the students have had a chance to meet the other characters, use the questions below to encourage students to share about the experience.
 - What did you learn that surprised you?
 - Who found someone with a different opinion or experience from your assigned character?
 - How is NAFTA affecting workers in Mexico? Workers in the United States? Corporations? Immigration rates? Use stories you heard to support your answers.
 - What questions do you have after completing this activity?
7. Before students can discuss revisions to NAFTA, they will need more information about the NAFTA record. Divide students into small groups. Distribute one of the articles listed below to each group. (*Note: Because the last two articles are longer than the others, divide them in half and distribute among two different groups*).

Students may read their assigned article aloud, highlight information they find important or surprising, and write questions in the margins. Students will prepare a summary of the article as a group.

- Bacon, David. [“NAFTA’s legacy – Profits and Poverty.”](#) San Francisco Chronicle, Jan. 14, 2004.
<http://www.organicconsumers.org/corp/nafta011904.cfm>
- Jordan, Mary and Kevin Sullivan. [“Trade Brings Riches, but Not to Mexico’s Poor.”](#) Washington Post, March 22, 2003.
<http://www.globalpolicy.org/soecon/ffd/2003/0322mexico.htm>
- Pollan, Michael. [“A Flood of U.S. Corn Rips at Mexico.”](#) Los Angeles Times, April 23, 2004.
<http://www.commondreams.org/views04/0423-02.htm>
- Scott, Robert E. [“The High Price of Free Trade: NAFTA’s Failure Has Cost the United States Jobs Across the Nation.”](#) Economic Policy Institute, Nov. 17, 2003.
http://www.epi.org/content.cfm/briefingpapers_bp147
- Wallach, Jason and Susan Williams. [“Why are so many people coming to the United States from Mexico?”](#) Highlander Center.
<http://www.highlandercenter.org/pdf-files/arn-mexico-and-immigration.pdf>

8. When all groups are finished, ask a group representative to share the summary of the group’s article with the class. What information did the group find surprising or important? What information should the class know about NAFTA in order to make an informed decision about revising NAFTA? How did the assigned article connect to the immigration debate? What other questions did the group have after reading the article?
9. List the positive effects of NAFTA as a class. List the negative effects of NAFTA. List the human rights issues you learned about during the role play and in the articles. List the environmental issues you heard or read about.
10. Announce to the class that you will be initiating a policy discussion about revising NAFTA. Divide students into small groups of four. Students will again adopt their conference roles. Each group should have two CEOs, businessmen, or government interests and two workers, union representatives, or activists. As a group, students will brainstorm in character about ways to revise NAFTA so that it benefits workers, corporations, the environment and the economy, while also addressing immigration. The solution they come up with should benefit all parties involved. Students should consider the following questions during group work:
 - How will your version of NAFTA fix the negative aspects of NAFTA you listed as a class?
 - How will your version address the human rights issues you listed as a class?
 - How will your version address the environmental issues you listed as a class?

- How will your version of NAFTA affect the poor in Mexico?
- How will your version affect job growth in the United States?
- How will your version affect corporate profits?
- How will your version affect worker's rights?
- How might your version affect the number of people immigrating to the United States?
- How might your version of NAFTA impact the economy?

11. When all students are finished working, ask groups to share their proposals with the class. Discuss pros and cons of each proposal.

12. Instruct students to refer back to the debate chart they made in the introductory activity. Consider the debate topic again and write information they learned from this lesson in the pro and con columns. Ask if students have any further questions.

Wage Comparison Questions

Directions: Click on the U.S./Mexico Interactive Shopping Trip link on the following Web site: <http://www.ueinternational.org> . Compare wages for different careers in the United States and Mexico and see how many hours you would have to work to afford various products in each country. Use the website to answer the questions below.

1. Many companies such as Sony, Pepsi, and Nike have locations in many different countries, including the United States and Mexico. How much does an unskilled factory worker make in the United States? How much does an unskilled factory worker make in Mexico? Why do you think there is such a large difference in wages?
2. Make a basic grocery list for the week. Include groceries and one month's rent in your shopping basket. How many hours would an unskilled factory worker in the United States have to work to pay for groceries and rent? How many hours would an unskilled factory worker in Mexico have to work to pay for the same goods?
3. According to the Web site, one month's rent in a working class neighborhood is \$654 per month in the United States and \$125.66 per month in Mexico. Based on a 40 hour work week, what percentage of an unskilled American factory worker's monthly salary will go towards rent? What percentage of an unskilled Mexican factory worker's monthly salary will go towards rent?
4. List the cost of two goods from each of the four shopping categories for both Mexico and the United States. What products cost more in Mexico than in the United States? What products cost less? Why do you think there is a difference in prices for the same goods (such as a Dell computer or a Nissan car)?
5. What profession makes the most money in Mexico? What profession makes the most money in the United States?
6. If you worked for a large corporation with locations in both Mexico and the United States, how would you react upon discovering that your American counterparts are making significantly more money to do the same job? Would you consider immigrating to the United States in order to make more money? Why or why not? What other choices do you have besides emigrating?
7. Imagine that you are the CEO of a new garment factory. Would you want to locate your business in the United States, Mexico, or another country? Explain your reasoning.
8. What information did you find surprising or interesting during this activity? What other questions or insights do you have?

NAFTA Role Play

Scenario:

It is May 2009, and CEOs and policy makers from Canada, the United States and Mexico have been invited to a conference in New York City in order to evaluate the effects of NAFTA on its 15th anniversary. Workers, environmentalists, and union members have not been invited to the conference, but have gathered outside the building in protest. The goal of the protestors is to revise NAFTA so that it benefits workers and the environment. The goal of the CEOs and policy makers is to ensure NAFTA benefits corporations and the economy.

Directions:

Read your assigned role several times. Decide on a name for your character and make a nametag (*Ex. Maria, maquiladora worker*). Your goal is to network with others, explain who you are, and understand how NAFTA has affected each of you. At the end of the meet and greet session, you will work in character to develop a revised version of NAFTA that benefits workers, corporations, the environment and the economy, while also stabilizing immigration.

Questions:

1. Find someone who has been positively affected by NAFTA. Who is the person? How has NAFTA helped this person?
2. Find someone who has been negatively affected by NAFTA. Who is the person? How has NAFTA negatively impacted this person?
3. Find a farmer who supports NAFTA. Who is the person? How has NAFTA benefited his or her farm?
4. Find a farmer who is against NAFTA. Who is the person? How has NAFTA caused his or her farm to suffer?
5. Find a business owner in support of NAFTA. Who is the person? How has NAFTA benefited his or her business?
6. Find a business owner who is against NAFTA. Who is the person? How has NAFTA caused his or her business to suffer?
7. Find someone who has immigrated or wants to immigrate to the United States. Who is the person? How has NAFTA affected his or her decision to immigrate?
8. Find an activist. Who is the person? For what organization does this person work? What is his or her opinion about NAFTA?
9. Find one person with an opposing view about NAFTA. Who is the person? What does this person think about NAFTA and why? How might the two of you work together to revise NAFTA?

NAFTA Conference: Roles

Directions: Cut out the 16 roles and distribute one role to each student in the class. Some students may play the same role.

<p>Owner of Small Farm in Mexico For years, I have grown corn and beans on my own farmland that was given to my grandfather during the land reform in the 1930s. At that time, President Lazaro Cardenas distributed 45 million acres of land to poor farmers. I grow some food for my family, but I sell the rest at the local market. NAFTA removed most tariffs on food, which has been a disaster for me. Mexican corn sells for \$240 a ton, while corn produced on large scale Iowa farms sells for \$110 a ton. With all this cheap corn flooding our market, I now have no place to sell my corn and beans. I still need money for my family and to send my children to school. It looks like we're going to lose our farm because of NAFTA. We will have to move to Mexico City or the United States to look for work. All I want to do is keep farming my own land!</p>	<p>Owner of Chicken Operation in Mexico I work on a chicken farm in Jalisco, Mexico's top chicken producing region. After NAFTA, cheap chicken exports from the United States started to flood the Mexican market. As a member of the Poultry Farmers Association, I've petitioned the Mexican government to restore the tariff protections on chicken because I want to be able to make a living doing what I know in my own community. Many of my co-workers migrated to the United States and were hired by Tyson chicken at low wages and in unsafe working conditions. They are threatened with deportation if they try to unionize or ask for better wages. Ironic – chickens and capital can cross the border legally, but workers can't. It seems that Tyson benefits by selling chicken in Mexico and by hiring the displaced workers at cheap salaries in the United States. But how does NAFTA benefit me?</p>
<p>Owner of Large Farm in Mexico I've been waiting for Article 27 of the Mexican constitution to be eliminated for years. Because of Article 27, I'm not allowed to own more than 250 acres of irrigated land. Instead, land that I have the money to pay for is given to poor farmers. Why shouldn't I be able to buy all the land I can afford? I will employ farmers on my land and they will get a guaranteed income working for me. Isn't that better than scratching out a living at the local market? I've grown corn on my land in the past, but corn is no longer profitable since NAFTA allowed cheap U.S. corn to flood the Mexican market. Vegetables are the wave of the future – I can grow vegetables all year long and my labor costs are much lower than in the U.S. I plan to freeze some of my vegetables and sell them to corporations such as Birds Eye in the United States. Free trade equals big money for me.</p>	<p>Owner of Large Farm in U.S. I own about a thousand acres in the Midwest where I grow corn and soybeans. In the years prior to NAFTA, I was in competition with Mexican farms. I still did ok, but in the years since NAFTA, I have really started to make a profit. After NAFTA, U.S. agricultural exports grew by 156%, and profits increased from \$3.6 billion per year to \$10.8 billion per year, a new record! I am proud of my farm because I am able to employ a lot of people, and my food feeds people all over the world. I read all the time about the poverty in Mexico – I'm helping keep the corn prices low so that ordinary people can afford to buy corn for their tortillas. Also, I employ many Mexicans on my farm. Several of my employees send money home to their families. I hear that remittances make up over 2% of the Mexican GDP. Overall, I feel that NAFTA has helped me and Mexico.</p>

<p style="text-align: center;">Owner of Factory in U.S.</p> <p>I am the CEO of Tyson Chicken, based in the United States. Along with the Mexican company, Bachoco, we control 52% of the chicken market in Mexico, thanks in large part to foreign investment rules under NAFTA. Also, thanks to NAFTA, we don't have to waste money on environmental controls on our Mexican plants. And we can hire cheaper labor in Mexico. We have also been able to do away with unions and drive down wages in the U.S. For years, U.S. unions drove up wages to the point that we could barely afford to pay workers and keep a good profit margin. Now wages are at a sustainable level and our profits are bigger than ever! Plus, we employ Mexican nationals who send part of their wages back to Mexico. We are helping both the Mexican and U.S. economies no matter how you look at it!</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Maquiladora Operator</p> <p>I am an operator of a maquiladora (factory) in the border town of Otay Mesa, Mexico. Since NAFTA, many U.S. factories moved over the border because of the efficiency of our workers and our lower operating costs. If you take into consideration all the incentives we offer our workers, laborers at our plant start at \$8 per day compared to the national rate of \$4.53 per day. Not only are we providing jobs, we are providing a steady income for the thousands of people pouring in from the countryside looking for work. The goods we produce are high quality, and the wages are fair. We do not have to worry about the high cost of complying with environmental regulations, which keeps our overhead costs low. Overall, NAFTA has increased our profits and provided job security for millions of workers.</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">U.S. Factory Worker</p> <p>I started working for a factory that produces rotors 25 years ago, when I was 18. I enjoy the people I work with, I've accumulated vacation time, and I've worked with the union to secure good health and retirement benefits. Last week, our company announced they were moving factory operations to Mexico. I'm 43-years-old – how am I going to start all over again? If and when another factory hires me, how can I guarantee that they won't move over the border in five or ten years? My family and I will have to move in order to find a job with similar pay and benefits. I could always work for minimum wage at McDonald's, but I would have to work two jobs to pay the rent. I've lived in this community my whole life – the last thing I want to do is move in search of work. It doesn't seem right that the companies are no longer accountable to their workers.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Maquiladora Worker</p> <p>I moved to Chilpancingo from a small village in southern Mexico last summer with my husband and two young children. None of the factories would hire my husband because the maquiladora owners prefer young women like me. When I applied for the job, the supervisor made me take a pregnancy test because he said that the company does not have the money to pay for maternity leave or to hold a position for a pregnant woman. I make \$5 a day, which is enough to buy food and other basic necessities. We live in a settlement near the factory and everyday I walk by the river polluted with all the chemicals from the maquiladoras. Everywhere there is trash and pollution. I miss our village, but I know there is no work there. Because of NAFTA, I cannot live in my village, I cannot cross legally into the United States to find a better paying job, and I am forced to accept a job at \$5 a day while I live in the polluted outskirts of a city completely foreign to me.</p>

<p style="text-align: center;">Factory Worker in China</p> <p>In the first few years after NAFTA, Mexican workers experienced a surge in jobs as American factories moved across the border in search of cheaper wages and less stringent environmental regulations. Now, however, factories are starting to move from Mexico to China in search of even lower wages for workers. Workers like me are leaving rural areas to find work in the cities. Because of free trade and globalization, I now have a job at an American factory sewing blue jeans for \$120 per month. I have heard that America has fallen on economic hard times, but we are making as many pairs of blue jeans as ever. Free trade is good because it helped me get a job to feed my family.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">U.S. Labor Union Representative</p> <p>After NAFTA, many workers in U.S. businesses no longer wanted to participate in union efforts. When we investigated, we found that many companies were threatening to move their factories across the border or overseas if workers organized. That's when we realized that our union efforts, like the companies we target, need to be multinational. We've started visiting our counterparts at Mexican factories and learning about labor conditions in Mexico. Mexican union leaders have also toured American factories to learn about labor conditions here. As Martin Luther King Jr. said, "Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere." If corporations are allowed to get away with low wages, pollution and unsafe working conditions in one country, corporations who pay fair wages and abide by environmental wages will not be able to compete. When we work together internationally to protect worker's rights everywhere, we are also protecting out worker's rights at home.</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Environmental Justice Worker</p> <p>I am a member of an environmental organization with members on both sides of the border who are concerned about the environmental effects of NAFTA. Many American companies are tempted to relocate to Mexico because the environmental regulations are less stringent (and less costly) than in the United States. For example, many companies dump chemical waste directly into Mexican rivers. Also, NAFTA has allowed U.S. logging companies to buy Mexican forests for clearcutting, which will have disastrous effects for Mexico. In addition, all the goods that are produced in Mexico have to be transported back to the United States, requiring the environmentally costly use of diesel fuel. Environmental degradation in one part of the world affects us all. That is why people on both sides of the border are working to strengthen environmental regulations in Mexico.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">U.S. Border Patrol Agent</p> <p>NAFTA took effect in 1994, and Operation Gatekeeper started in 1995. As thousands of Mexican workers fight for low paying jobs at maquiladoras and thousands more are forced off their farmland, we have seen a dramatic increase in illegal border crossings. I oversee a popular border crossing in Arizona. We thought that increased fencing and enforcement would force people to cross in the desert, which would then act as a natural border and deterrent. Instead, we have seen a dramatic increase in immigrant deaths, an increase in coyote premiums for guiding people across the desert, and a decrease in circular or seasonal migration, as the increased danger of the border crossing encourages people to stay in the United States. \$6 billion dollars spent on enforcement and 275,000 people still crossing the border each year. More than 500 illegal immigrants died in 2005 alone. As an agent, I have to enforce our immigration policies, but I have also seen the human tragedies caused by those policies.</p>

<p style="text-align: center;">Coyote</p> <p>For years, I have helped smuggle migrants into the United States. In the early 1990s, traveling to the United States was easy – I often showed people where to swim across the river or where to jump over the fence. Now I have to guide people on much more dangerous journeys through the desert. I show people where to walk across the desert, tell them how much water to bring, and warn them about border patrol agents. Because of the increased danger, I’ve increased my prices. I’m also taking more people than ever across the border. NAFTA has been hard on the people, but good on my bank account.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Foreign Born Wife of U.S. Citizen</p> <p>Personally, I hate NAFTA. I mean, it’s been good for my husband’s business, but it’s made my visa application even more of a hassle. My husband and I met while he was working in Mexico a few years ago. We were married last year, and we thought it would be easy for me to get a green card. Instead, because of NAFTA and all the illegal immigration it has caused, Mexico is way over its country limit for immigrants. I’ve been waiting for three years to get my green card approved. While we’ve been waiting, I gave birth to our first child in Mexico. My husband is still working in the United States. I just want our family to live together!</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Timber Industry Executive</p> <p>We have almost seen the end of cheap timber in the United States – especially considering all the environmental hassle about clearcutting trees. Clearcutting makes good business sense – I can harvest trees cheaply and efficiently and sell the wood at better prices. Once NAFTA was enacted, we had a whole new market to explore: Mexican forests. My company has been buying land, clearcutting it, and transporting the wood to the United States. Even considering the increased cost of fuel, it’s still cheaper to harvest wood in Mexico. Overall, NAFTA encouraged me to invest in the Mexican economy, hire Mexican workers, and harvest Mexican trees. Increased investment in Mexico has been good for me and good for the people I employ.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Business Opposing NAFTA</p> <p>I’m a small business owner in the United States who has worked for years producing quality American products. I have always prided myself on hiring American workers and using American materials. Now I have to import materials from China because no one makes them in the United States anymore. Still, I hire American workers to assemble the goods. I am trying to compete against companies who have moved their production plants to Mexico and who pay much lower wages than I do. Also, they do not offer health insurance or other benefits to their employees like I do. I refuse to pay my workers less than what they are worth or withhold benefits from them. My ethics, however, are seriously hurting my profits. NAFTA has made my business less competitive and I am thinking about filing bankruptcy. The idea of my employees losing their jobs, however, keeps me in business for now.</p>

Lesson Four: The Long Road to Citizenship

Lesson Overview:

In this lesson, students will evaluate their own knowledge about the rights and responsibilities of United States citizens and will research the process for becoming a citizen. Students will also evaluate and discuss President Bush's proposed path to citizenship for illegal immigrants.

Objectives:

Students will:

1. Understand the process for becoming a United States Citizen.
2. Analyze the ways in which current citizenship regulations affect immigration.
3. Evaluate President Bush's path to citizenship proposal.

Materials:

- ❖ Access to the internet or copies of the [U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Service's Naturalization Test](http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=6559820).
<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=6559820>
- ❖ Path to Citizenship Worksheet
- ❖ Construction Paper
- ❖ Colored Pencils and Markers

Activity: What is the Current Path to Citizenship in the United States? (50 minutes)

1. Inform students that they will be taking a pop quiz. Do not tell them what the quiz is about. Post or distribute the sample questions from the [U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Service's Naturalization Test](http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=6559820).
2. Students will exchange papers and grade the quiz as a class. Explain that this test is part of the path to citizenship for immigrants to the United States.
3. Why might a person want to become a United States citizen? What rights do people have as citizens of the United States? What responsibilities do citizens have? What rights do immigrants have? What responsibilities do immigrants have?
4. The path to citizenship can be long, costly and complex. According to the Migration Policy Institute, more than 460,000 people filed for naturalization (citizenship) in July 2007 alone, a process which can take up to five years. Divide students into small groups and assign each group one of the roles below. Students will research the process a person in their assigned situation must go through to become a United States citizen. Distribute "The Path to Citizenship" Worksheet and review directions with students.

Roles

- Permanent Resident of the United States (Has Green Card)
- Relative of a Permanent Resident of the United States

- A Nonimmigrant (someone here temporarily for work, school, tourism, or a medical procedure)
 - Refugee
 - Family member of a refugee
 - Husband or wife of a U.S. citizen
 - Illegal immigrant already living in United States (Research Proposed Paths to Citizenship)
5. When students are finished researching, ask each group to prepare a user friendly guide that explains the path to citizenship to someone in their assigned situation. The guide may contain images and texts.
 6. After all students are finished, ask groups to share their path to citizenship guides. What surprised them about this activity? What insights or questions do students have after completing this activity? Is the process for becoming a citizen harder or easier than they expected? How might the current citizenship process encourage or discourage illegal immigration?
 7. As a class, read [President Bush's path to citizenship proposal](#) for illegal immigrants.
(<http://www.whitehouse.gov/stateoftheunion/2007/initiatives/immigration.html>)
Under his plan, what would illegal immigrants have to do to become citizens? Do you think his proposal will encourage illegal immigrants to start the citizenship process? Why or why not? What changes or additions to the proposal does the class recommend? (**Note – If you have more time, research the [presidential candidates' path to citizenship proposals](#).*
(<http://millercenter.org/public/debates/immigration/candidates-plans>)
Compare and contrast the proposals. Which proposal do students think will most likely encourage illegal immigrants to begin the citizenship process?)
 8. Instruct students to refer back to the debate chart they made in the introductory activity. Consider the debate topic again and write information they learned from this lesson in the pro and con columns. Ask if students have any further questions.

The Path to Citizenship

Directions:

Research the process a person in your assigned situation must go through in order to become a United States citizen. You may use library books, the internet, or community resource centers in order to find the answers to the questions below.

Assigned Role: _____

Questions:

1. What are the steps in the process?

2. How long does the process typically take?

3. How much will the process cost?

4. Is the process easy to understand? Was it easy to find information about the process? Where did you find the information? List your sources.

5. Do you think the process would be easy to understand if English were not a person's first language?

6. How might you make the process easier to understand for immigrants in your assigned situation?

Lesson Five: Towards a Humane and Effective Immigration Policy

Lesson Overview:

In this lesson, students will research and debate current immigration reform proposals. Students will then vote which policy option, or combination of policies, they think would most effectively address current immigration issues.

Objectives:

Students will:

- 1) Research and understand current immigration proposals.
- 2) Evaluate the pros and cons of current immigration proposals.

Materials:

- ❖ Internet Access and/or library access

Activity One: Evaluating Current Immigration Proposals (50 minutes)

1. Inform students that they will be taking part in an International Organization for Migration (IOM) International Dialogue on Migration. IOM provides advice and services to international governments concerning, among other things, the implementation of humane immigration laws.
2. Divide students into small groups and assign each group one policy option.

Policy Options

- Open door policy of immigration to NAFTA partners (Canada and Mexico)
 - Temporary or guest worker program
 - Employer Sanctions: Penalize employers who hire illegal immigrants and mandate that all businesses use the E-Verify system to verify citizenship status.
 - Increased Enforcement: Build a longer and more technologically advanced fence between the United States and Mexico. Hire additional border patrol agents to police the border.
 - Mass Deportation of Illegal Immigrants: Build additional prisons to hold illegal immigrants who are awaiting deportation. Increase funding for deportation.
 - Revise NAFTA so that it benefits workers, businesses, the economy and the environment
 - Path to Citizenship: Provide a path to citizenship for the 12 million illegal immigrants already living in the United States.
 - Pass the DREAM Act.
3. Each group will research and explain the pros and cons of their assigned policy option. The groups will present a summary of the reform policy and how it might

impact immigration rates and people's immigration experiences. Other groups will then have a chance to ask questions about the policy.

4. Students will then vote on the policy option, or combination of options, they think would best benefit citizens of the United States, immigrants, workers, business owners, and the environment. Did the policies chosen address all areas of immigration? What other policies do students think legislators should consider? You will be the moderator for this exercise.
5. Instruct students to refer back to the debate chart they made in the introductory activity. Consider the debate topic again and write information they learned from this lesson in the pro and con columns. Ask if students have any further questions.

Lesson Six: Engaging in Debate

The Resolution: “*Our national interests require a path to citizenship for the 12 million illegal immigrants presently here.*”

Time: 1 class period for research; 1 class period for debate

Objectives:

Students will:

1. Understand opposing views of the immigration debate
2. Explain and defend their views about immigration

Materials:

- [Miller Center of Public Affairs: Immigration Resources](http://millercenter.org/public/debates/immigration)
http://millercenter.org/public/debates/immigration
- Resource guide and suggested links
- Internet Access
- [IDEA – International Debate Education Association](http://www.idebate.org/)
http://www.idebate.org/
- Student Debate Guide

Procedure:

Activity One: Review of Lessons Learned (30 minutes)

1. Instruct students to make a metaphorical drawing of immigration. The picture could depict the US/Mexico border, immigration policy, immigrant experiences, or concerns about immigration. According to [Rethinking Schools](http://www.rethinkingschools.org/archive/17_02/Rg172.shtml), (http://www.rethinkingschools.org/archive/17_02/Rg172.shtml) “A metaphorical drawing asks students to take an insight about an issue and turn it into a picture.” Students will explain their picture in writing on the back of the paper. To view an example, go to [Mexico in Metaphors](http://www.rethinkingschools.org/archive/20_03/lbu203.shtml) at the Rethinking Schools Web site. (http://www.rethinkingschools.org/archive/20_03/lbu203.shtml)
2. View and discuss student work as a class.
3. Instruct students to refer back to the debate chart they made in the introductory activity. Consider the debate topic again and write information they learned from this lesson in the pro and con columns. Ask if students have any further questions.

Activity Two: Debate (90 minutes)

There are many options for classroom debate – use the IDEA link for additional debate formats and suggestions.

1. Divide the students into two groups. One group will be in favor of the resolution and one group will be against the resolution. Students may choose which side they would like to debate, or the teacher may assign debate roles.

2. Distribute the student debate guide and review the procedure and rules of debate. Students should use the debate chart they have been keeping throughout the lessons. All group members should participate in research for the debate using the resource guide, Miller Center materials, and PBS materials. Instruct students to anticipate possible critiques of their perspective so that they will more completely explain and defend their views during the debate. Students should support their statements with facts and research whenever possible. Students may use visual aids and graphs to strengthen their argument.
3. The teacher may declare a formal timed debate or an informal roundtable discussion depending on time and teacher preference.
4. After the debate, give students time to share points they found especially persuasive, arguments they found to be particularly strong, areas they still have questions about, insights they had during the debate, and ideas or proposals for actions they can take to promote humane immigration reform.

Suggested Research Links

Articles and Studies

Bacon, David. "[NAFTA's legacy – Profits and Poverty.](#)" San Francisco Chronicle, Jan. 14, 2004.

<http://www.organicconsumers.org/corp/nafta011904.cfm>

Jordan, Mary and Kevin Sullivan. "[Trade Brings Riches, but Not to Mexico's Poor.](#)" Washington Post, March 22, 2003.

<http://www.globalpolicy.org/soecon/ffd/2003/0322mexico.htm>

Massey, Douglas D. "[Backfire at the Border: Why Enforcement Without Legalization Cannot Stop Illegal Immigration.](#)" Center for Trade Policy Studies, June 13, 2005.

<http://www.freetrade.org/pubs/pas/tpa-029.pdf>

Pollan, Michael. "[A Flood of U.S. Corn Rips at Mexico.](#)" Los Angeles Times, April 23, 2004.

<http://www.commondreams.org/views04/0423-02.htm>

Scott, Robert E. "[The High Price of Free Trade: NAFTA's Failure Has Cost the United States Jobs Across the Nation.](#)" Economic Policy Institute, Nov. 17, 2003.

http://www.epi.org/content.cfm/briefingpapers_bp147

Wallach, Jason and Susan Williams. "[Why are so many people coming to the United States from Mexico?](#)" Highlander Center.

<http://www.highlandercenter.org/pdf-files/arn-mexico-and-immigration.pdf>

Books, Television and Film

Becoming American: New Immigration Stories – A Reading List

This website, sponsored by the American Library Association (ALA) features reading lists on the topic of immigration for children, young adults, and adults.

<http://publicprograms.ala.org/newimmigration/materials/>

PBS Frontline World – “Mexico: A Death in the Desert”

The website for this story, which details one man's fatal attempt to immigrate to the United States, features maps, background on the issues in the immigration debate, links to resources, and immigration facts and figures.

<http://www.pbs.org/frontlineworld/stories/mexico/thestory.html>

Facts and Figures

Migration Information Source

Immigration graphs, statistics, articles, and analysis.

www.migrationinformation.org

NPR – The Immigration Debate

This site features recent news headlines concerning immigration along with maps, photos, videos, radio broadcasts, interactive features and in-depth analysis of the immigration debate.

<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=5310549>

The New York Times – A Harsh Path of Hope

An interactive multimedia feature that highlights the dangers of crossing the border since Operation Gatekeeper was implemented. Once on the website, search for “A Harsh Path of Hope.”

www.newyorktimes.com

Washington Post – The Battle Over Immigration

This site features all recent news headlines concerning immigration along with maps, photos, videos, and in-depth analysis of the immigration debate.

<http://www.washingtonpost.com>

Lesson Plans

National Geographic “God Grew Tired of Us” – Teacher’s Guide

God Grew Tired of Us is a documentary that follows several Sudanese refugees as they try to adapt to life in the United States.

<http://www.nationalgeographic.com/xpeditions/lessons/09/g912/ggtu2.html>

PBS “China From the Inside” – Educator’s Guide

The lessons in this guide explore the impact of globalization on workers in China, and would be a good supplement to discussions about globalization’s effect on Mexico and worldwide immigration patterns.

<http://www.pbs.org/kqed/chinainside/educators.html>

PBS “Destination America” – Teacher’s Guide

The teacher’s guide accompanies the four part PBS “Destination America” series and focuses on the reasons people migrate. The guide is created around the five freedoms: Freedom From Fear, Freedom to Create, Freedom From Oppression, Freedom From Want, and Freedom of Religion.

<http://www.pbs.org/destinationamerica/teachersguide.html>

PBS NewsHour Online Extra – “Immigration Reform – Understanding the Issue From Different Points of View”

http://www.pbs.org/newshour/extra/teachers/lessonplans/socialstudies/immigration_reform.html

PBS Independent Lens “The New Americans” – Educator’s Guide

“The New Americans” details the immigrant experience through the eyes of five immigrants from five different countries. Eleven interactive lesson plans accompany the stories and help students understand the history and reality of the immigrant experience.

<http://www.pbs.org/independentlens/newamericans/foreducators.html>

Rethinking Schools

In-depth and reflective lesson plans about Mexican migration to the United States.

www.rethinkingschool.org/mexico

Organizations

CATO Institute – Immigration and Labor Markets

In-depth research, analysis, and recommendations concerning immigration reform.

<http://www.cato.org>

International Organization for Migration (IOM)

IOM advises governments around the world and helps provide governments with the information they need to craft humane and effective immigration policies. The site has a wealth of resources that will help students situate the immigration debate within the context of global migration patterns.

www.iom.int

National Employment Law Project (NELP) – Immigrant Worker Project

This excellent resource contains articles, research studies, immigration facts and figures, and fact sheets comparing policy proposals.

<http://www.immigrant-nonstandard.org>

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Service (UCIS)

www.uscis.gov

Link to National Standards

Taken from: www.mcrel.org

Civics Standards

1. Understands ideas about civic life, politics, and government
2. Understands the essential characteristics of limited and unlimited governments
9. Understands the importance of Americans sharing and supporting certain values, beliefs, and principles of American constitutional democracy
11. Understands the role of diversity in American life and the importance of shared values, political beliefs, and civic beliefs in an increasingly diverse American society
13. Understands the character of American political and social conflict and factors that tend to prevent or lower its intensity
19. Understands what is meant by "the public agenda," how it is set, and how it is influenced by public opinion and the media
21. Understands the formation and implementation of public policy
22. Understands how the world is organized politically into nation-states, how nation-states interact with one another, and issues surrounding U.S. foreign policy
23. Understands the impact of significant political and nonpolitical developments on the United States and other nations

25. Understands issues regarding personal, political, and economic rights
26. Understands issues regarding the proper scope and limits of rights and the relationships among personal, political, and economic rights

Economics

2. Understands characteristics of different economic systems, economic institutions, and economic incentives
6. Understands the roles government plays in the United States economy
10. Understands basic concepts about international economics

Geography

1. Understands the characteristics and uses of maps, globes, and other geographic tools and technologies
2. Knows the location of places, geographic features, and patterns of the environment
9. Understands the nature, distribution and migration of human populations on Earth's surface
11. Understands the patterns and networks of economic interdependence on Earth's surface
12. Understands the patterns of human settlement and their causes
13. Understands the forces of cooperation and conflict that shape the divisions of Earth's surface

Thinking and Reasoning Standards

1. Understands and applies the basic principles of presenting an argument
2. Understands and applies basic principles of logic and reasoning
3. Effectively uses mental processes that are based on identifying similarities and differences

About the Author: *Rebecca Catron is a freelance writer, English teacher, and member of Amnesty International's National Steering Committee for Human Rights Education. Rebecca has published articles and co-authored several educational guides. Her most recent project is writing curriculum for [In Plain Sight: A Video Human Rights Education Program](#), a collaboration between WITNESS and Amnesty International. She resides in Sunnyvale, California.*